

**THE UNIVERSITY OF TEXAS AT SAN ANTONIO
DOCUMENTS AND PROCEEDINGS OF THE GRADUATE COUNCIL
ACTION MINUTES
ORDER OF BUSINESS**

April 6, 2010

**University Room, BB 2.06.04
3:30 p.m.**

Present: David Akopian, John Alexander, Rena Bizios, Norma Cantu, Michael Cepek, Andrey Chabanov, Sara Oswalt (substitute for Bill Cooke), Jim Dykes, Dorothy Flannagan, Norma Guerra, Anjali Gupta, Richard Hartley, Kim Kline, Myung Ko, Walter Ermler (for Don Kurtz), Lance Lambert, Francisco Marcos- Marin, Gregg Michel, Sharon Navarro, Emeka Nwaeze, Joel Saegert, Mark Suazo (substitute for Rudy Sandoval), Scott Sherer, Howard Smith, Drew Stephen, Nandini Kannan (for Ram Tripathi), Lila Truett, John Wald, Jose Wiessmann, Raj Wilson, Xu Xiaohe, Weining Zhang

Absent: Julie Bland, Sean Guidry, Adrian Lipscombe, Rene Nank, Anne S. Reamy, Brian Smith, Heather Trepal, Mary Zey

Excused: Kim Bilica, Mary Kay Houston Vega, Elizabeth Murakami, Can Saygin, Ryan Sprott, Garry Sunter

Visitors:

Mark Appleford GAR, MS in Biomedical Engineering
Brian Derrick GAR, Biology/Neurobiology
Jim Kelim Director, English as a Second Language Services
Juliet Langman, Associate Professor, Bicultural-Bilingual Studies
AT Papagiannakis Chair, Civil Engineering
Monica Rodriguez Graduate Admissions, Graduate School
John Warren, Presenter of Follow-Up of PhD & MS in Computer Science
Wayne Wright, Program Chair for MA in Teaching English as a Second Language

I. Call to order and taking of attendance.

Dr. Norma Cantú called the April 6, 2010 meeting of the Graduate Council to order at 3:39 pm.

II. Approval of Minutes (Norma Cantú)

The Minutes of the March 2, 2010 meeting were corrected to reflect that Dr. Cantú had called for approval of the February 2, 2010 Minutes. As corrected, the Minutes of the March 2, 2010 meeting were approved.

III. Reports

A. Council Chair (Norma Cantú)

Dr. Cantú welcomed our visitors who were invited to the meeting to help with the discussion of the four follow-up reports and the discussion of the Test of English as a

Foreign Language (TOEFL) score requirements. She moved that the Bylaws be suspended to allow their discussion. The motion was unanimously approved.

Dr. Cantú explained that the election of officers for 2010 / 2011 would be conducted under new business in order to accommodate our visitors.

B. Dean of Graduate School (Dorothy Flannagan)

Dean Dorothy Flannagan noted that the visit by the Southern Association of Colleges and Schools (SACS) was very successful. There were no recommendations for Academic Affairs. She thanked the graduate programs that were able to supply syllabi 2 days before the visit (142 syllabi were made available to reviewers). The reviewer who met with Dean Flannagan was very impressed and might recommend implementing some of our practices at her home University.

C. Secretary (Jim Dykes)

Dr. Jim Dykes provided an update to the list of Graduate Council members for September 2010- May 2011 (Attachment A). Of the 19 department programs that are electing representatives, the results of 16 elections are complete. The election of the representative for Architecture was delayed due to Dr. Dykes sending the request to the College of Architecture rather than the Department of Architecture. Elections are under way in the Departments of Accounting and Health & Kinesiology. After Attachment A of the Agenda was distributed, Dr. Ram Tripathi was elected to represent Management Science & Statistics, Dr. Mark Bayer was elected to represent English, Dr. Richard Hartley was re-elected to represent Criminal Justice, and Dr. Hongjie Xie was elected to represent Geological Sciences. Dr. Dykes is grateful for the Departments holding the elections so promptly at such a busy time in the semester. Having the Graduate Council membership in place allows us to form our standing committees.

D. Committee on Graduate Programs and Courses (Xiaohe Xu)

Dr. Xiaohe Xu explained that the draft 2011- 2013 Graduate Catalog is a large document with many changes requiring more than a half hour to review. Pending committee review, he will present the PhD in Translational Science proposal at our May 4th meeting. The proposal is for a joint degree between UTSA, UTHSCSA, and UT Austin's College of Pharmacy & Pharmacotherapy. The UT School of Public Health (San Antonio Regional Campus) will also participate.

E. Membership Committee (Scott Sherer)

Dr. Scott Sherer referred the Graduate Council to the list of applicants for Adjoint membership (Attachment B, page 3194 of the Agenda) and the list of applicants for Special Membership of the Graduate Faculty (Attachment B, page 3195 of the Agenda). All of the 15 Adjoint applicants hold the terminal degree in their area. Of the eight Special Membership applicants, seven hold the terminal degree in their area. The single exception (Stephen Ackley) has been a Research Associate since 2006 and is applying to be reappointed in order to serve on a student's committee. Dr. Gregg Michel asked about Dr. Robert Browning who is currently serving on a thesis committee. Dr. Sherer explained that the new application was for teaching a graduate course. Both lists of applicants were unanimously approved.

Next Dr. Sherer referred the Graduate Council to Attachments C and D of the Agenda: proposed changes to the Bylaws as track changes and as a clean copy, respectively. He provided three reasons for the proposed changes: 1) to make our Bylaws compliant with the current Handbook of Operating Procedures (HOP), 2) to clarify the distinction between Adjoint and Special Members (as well as clarifying the procedures for each), and 3) a change to allow limited functions or term of Special Members. He explained that Adjoint faculty are Members of the Graduate Faculty working with two programs (Physics and Biomedical Engineering) that have teaming agreements with the UTHSCSA and SWRI. The duration of their term is five years before renewal is required. Special Members of the Graduate Faculty are either non-tenure track faculty at UTSA or are from outside. Currently, the duration of their term is three years before renewal is required and they are authorized to teach graduate courses and serve on thesis and dissertation committees. The new change concerns Special Members. If approved, the Graduate Program Committee may choose to delimit the applicant's term to less than three years and / or may choose to delimit their duties to a subset of teaching, serving on thesis committees, and serving on dissertation committees. That would give the Departments more choices when they forward the applications and would allow the Graduate Council to see their duties. If the change to the Bylaws is approved, then the option will be included in the application form. Dr. Rena Bizios pointed out that Adjoint faculty can chair thesis or dissertation committees, but that Special Members may only co-chair committees. The proposed Bylaws changes clarify that distinction, but do not alter current policy. Dr. Sherer also noted Special Members may serve on Graduate Program Committees; but, since they are not Members of the Graduate Faculty, may not serve on the Graduate Council. Sections redundant with the HOP were replaced with a simple link to the HOP.

Dr. Cantú thanked Dr. Sherer's committee for its professional and meticulous review of our Bylaws. She noted that any proposed change to our Bylaws requires a 30 day review period prior to taking a vote. No modifications to the proposal were made at the meeting. Since the unmodified proposal was distributed with the Agenda on April 1st, we will be able to vote on the proposal at our May 4th meeting.

F. Committee on Graduate Program Evaluation (Howard Smith)

Dr. Howard Smith's committee completed four Administrative follow-up reports: PhD & MS in Biomedical Engineering, PhD & MS in Computer Science, PhD in Environmental Science & Engineering, and PhD in Neurobiology (Attachments E, F, G, and H).

Dr. Jose Weissmann was the liaison and presented the report for Biomedical Engineering. The original evaluation was conducted in August 2008 and the follow-up meeting was held on February 9th, 2010. Dr. Weissmann reviewed the 10 recommendations from the original evaluation and the current responses. He noted the enhancements to the program. Dr. Cantú thanked Dr. Weissmann and accepted his report.

Dr. John Warren was the liaison and presented the report for Computer Science. The original evaluation was conducted in April 2008 and the follow-up meeting was held on February 9th, 2010. The follow-up meeting went very well. Dr. Warren reviewed the 19 recommendations from the original evaluation and the current responses. Dr. Smith noted that Dr. Weining Zhang is the representative for Computer Science on the Graduate

Council and praised the improvements since the evaluation. An exception (increased merit raises) is simply outside of Department control. Dr. Bizios asked about increasing the size of the faculty given that salaries are higher at other institutions. Dr. Zhang explained that some faculty had left, but that they had been replaced with new faculty. Dr. Smith noted that the report would alert the Dean to the need. Dr. Zhang noted that the Dean had sometimes needed to cancel searches. Dr. Cantú emphasized the importance of the recommendation while recognizing exigency. She accepted the follow-up report.

Dr. Smith presented the report for Environmental Science & Engineering: the six recommendations from the original evaluation in March 2009 and the responses from the follow-up meeting on February 9th. Dr. Raj Wilson noted the difficulty in hiring new faculty with the current budget constraints. Dr. A. T. Papagiannakis (Chair of Civil Engineering) highlighted the need to improve the coordination between his department and the departments of Biology and Geological Sciences. Dr. Emeka Nwaeze asked how we can help. Dean Flannagan said the unresolved coordination issue would be highlighted in the summary forwarded to the Dean and Provost. She also noted that a member of the Graduate Council will be on the committees established under the new program review procedures. Dr. Cantú accepted the follow-up report.

Dr. Kim Kline was the liaison and presented the report for Neurobiology. The original evaluation was conducted in August 2008 and the follow-up meeting was held on March 1st, 2010. Of the nine recommendations, seven are already done. The other two (increasing the number of student publications and exploring nontraditional career paths for the students) are on-going. She commended the work of Dr. Brian Derrick (GAR). Dr. Cantú accepted the follow-up report.

G. Committee on Academic Policy and Requirements (Andrey Chabanov)

No Report

IV. Unfinished Business

Dr. Cantú introduced Dr. Wayne Wright (Program Chair for MA in Teaching English as a Second Language), Dr. Juliet Langman (Bicultural-Bilingual Studies), and Monica Rodriguez (Graduate Admissions for the Graduate School) to lead our discussion of TOEFL scores. Two documents comparing our required scores to those of other institutions were distributed at the meeting (Attachments A and B). That information was presented in a PowerPoint slideshow.

The UTSA Strategic Plan (06) was cited. Four issues were highlighted for consideration: 1) Graduate student success, 2) clear vs conditional admission, 3) student preparation for (International) Teaching Assistants (ITA), and 4) English Language Proficiency requirements (described in the Graduate Catalog and acceptance letters sent to students). The UTSA admission requirement for Master's & Doctoral students and the In-House Assessment Exemption cut-offs were explained (see top of Attachment B). Prior training is required of all TAs. All International Students with a TA assignment are assessed with the SPEAK test. Scores below 50/60 require an ITA course (one semester). The exemptions are IBT speaking score of 27, 60 on Test of Spoken English (TSE), Superior

on ACTFL's OPI (Oral Proficiency Interview), and / or a graduate of an English-speaking university in the US, Canada, Australia, UK, Ireland, New Zealand.

For comparison, a summary was presented of the cut-offs for three of the short-term aspirant Universities shown in Attachment B: Arizona State University, University of California- Riverside, and University of Connecticut. Similarly, a summary was presented of the cut-offs for two of the UT System Universities shown in Attachment B: UT Austin and UT Arlington. Details from the "Notes" column of Attachment B were also provided. Based on a total of 323 records, average GPA linearly increased with Internet-Based TOEFL (IBT) score. Similarly, average GPA linearly increased with IBT score for the 254 records from the College of Sciences and the College of Engineering. There were students in each set with an IBT score less than 80 and a GPA less than 3.0. Students with an IBT score of at least 80 also had a GPA of at least 3.0. They recommended retaining the current TOEFL requirements for doctoral students and suggested that each master's program consider raising its TOEFL requirements. Finally, they recommended raising UTSA's IELTS cut-off to 6.5 in order to align it with other schools.

In response to a question, Monica Rodriguez stated that our program exceptions are generally consistent with other schools. Dr. Rena Bizios said she appreciated the presentation and she was glad that there are separate requirements for TAs. She also applauded the efforts to provide them with opportunities to improve. Dr. Wayne Wright and Monica Rodriguez noted that there are separate courses for speaking, reading, and writing. For reading and writing, there are specific courses designed for graduate students and they are supported by a computer lab thanks to a grant to Jim Kelim. In addition, there is tutoring available and the conversation program. Not many graduate students "volunteer", but the ITA program helps. Dr. Cantú thanked the visitors for their presentation and charged the Committee on Academic Policy and Requirements with reviewing their recommendations.

V. New Business

Dr. Cantú asked Dr. Kline to present her slate of officers for the 2010- 2011 Graduate Council. Dr. Kline proposed Drs. Scott Sherer for Chair, Jim Dykes for Secretary, and Rena Bizios for Parliamentarian. Due to the late hour, a number of members had left. A quick head count revealed that we barely had a quorum after adjusting for the members who had previously emailed Dr. Dykes or Ginger Hernandez about an excused absence. The slate of officers was approved by a voice vote.

VI. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 5:03.

Attachment A

UTSA strategic Plan (06) <http://www.utsa.edu/2016/strategic/6.html>

UTSA must increase our support for both undergraduate and graduate students, improve student success and graduation rates, and expand our global focus and linkages. Our students' preparation as future leaders must be demonstrable and measurable.

Short-term aspirants:

Arizona State University

English Proficiency

If you are from a country whose native language is not English, you must provide evidence of English proficiency as indicated by acceptable scores on the TOEFL or IELTS as follows:

- The minimum TOEFL requirement is 550 (PBT) or 80 (iBT).
- The minimum IELTS requirement is an overall band score of 6.5.
- The minimum Pearson Test of English (PTE) requirement is 60.

Individual academic units may have higher requirements. Please consult your department's website.

University of California, Riverside

- TOEFL paper minimum score 550
- TOEFL Internet-based minimum score 79
- IELTS minimum score is 7

University of Connecticut

The minimum score requirement for the TOEFL is 550 (paper-based), 213 (computer-based), or 79 (Internet-based). The minimum score requirement for the IELTS exam is 6.5. Test scores must be sent directly to the University of Connecticut from the respective testing service.

- University of Central Florida
- University of Oklahoma

Long-term aspirants:

University of California, Santa Barbara

- The minimum TOEFL score for consideration is 550 when taking the paper based test (PBT) and 80 when taking the internet based test (IBT)
- The minimum IELTS score for consideration is an Overall Band Score of 7.

University of Colorado, Boulder

- Applied Math 600/ 100
- Biological sciences — molecular, cellular, and developmental biology 600/100
- Chemistry 600/100
- Mechanical engineering (master's) 550/79
- Mechanical engineering (doctoral) 600/100
- Computer science 560/83

Rutgers University

TOEFL: 550 Paper;

The minimum TOEFL score is 213 (computer version) and 550 (paper version).

iBT minimum scores are as follows: Writing: 22, Speaking: 23, Reading: 21, and Listening: 17. The completion of a master's degree in the United States is not grounds for waiving test results.

IELTS: 7.

* English proficiency. Students admitted with English language deficiencies are tested upon arrival on campus and may be required to take English courses through the English as a Second Language Program.

Texas Institutions:

Texas State University (General TOEFL/EIS requirements).

- Paper-Based – 550 minimum
- Internet-Based Test minimums – 78 total score with the 4 minimum section scores of 19/reading, 19/listening, 19/speaking, and 18/writing
- IELTS (Academic) - 6.5 or higher with minimum individual module scores of 6.0

*If your TOEFL score is below the minimum score but falls between the following scores then you may apply to the Texas State Intensive English (TSIE) Bridge program:

- Paper-Based – between 500-547
- Internet-Based Test minimums – between 59-77 total score with the 4 minimum section scores of at least 14/reading, 14/listening, 14/speaking, and 14/writing
- IELTS (Academic) - 5.5-6.0

Requirements for the Computer Science Dept.

REGULAR ADMISSION REQUIREMENTS:

You also must have the GRE prior with a preferred score of **1000** with a minimum **300** verbal and 600 quantitative. The GRE will be waived if an applicant holds a Masters or Doctoral degree. International students must have the TOEFL on file.

Requirements for the Math Dept.

TOEFL REQUIREMENTS:

- Paper-Based – 600 minimum
- Internet-Based Test minimums – 78 total score with the 4 minimum section scores of 19/reading, 19/listening, 19/speaking, and 18/writing

IELTS (Academic) - 6.5 or higher with minimum individual module scores of 6.0

*Notice that Math puts part requirements on both TOEFL and IELTS

UT-Arlington

Computer Science: A Test of English as a Foreign Language (TOEFL) score – 230 (111 ibt/640 paper)

Architecture: TOEFL 550/80

Bioengineering: 575/

Attachment B

TOEFL Score Requirement Guide for Texas and Aspirant Graduate Institutions

University Requirements for Internet-Based TOEFL Score Subsections & IELTS										Institutional Testing if minimum scores are not met?	Notes
	IBT	PBT	IELTS	Reading	Listening	Speaking	Writing				
University of Texas at San Antonio	Master's	61	500	5.0						Possible. Higher score may qualify for exemption.	
	Doctoral	79	550	6.5							
English Lang. Assessment Testing Exemp.		100	600	7.0							
University of Texas System											
University of Texas at Austin		79	550	6.5	Depends on the program of study			Possible	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Students must Complete Bachelor's degree for waiver. Master's degree alone is not sufficient. Departments may have additional requirements for TA positions. Any international student record with a TOEFL below 600 PBT / 250 CBT / 100 IBT or a low GRE verbal score, ESL assessment. Those with IBT scores, the bar will be placed with a speaking and/or writing score below 23. The second way for a J-bar to appear on a student record is for a department to contact ESL Services and ask that a J-bar be placed on a particular student. 		
University of Texas at Arlington		79	550	6.5	20	16	21	22	Yes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Some programs have higher minimum score requirements. Score of 23 IBT or 7 IELTS speaking section required for TA position. Students conditionally accepted because of marginally acceptable scores are required in IEP. Developmental English Program - Scores not satisfying the English proficiency requirements for graduate teaching assistants must enroll in the Developmental English Program and be certified for English proficiency. 	
University of Texas at Dallas		80	550	6.5					Possible	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Minimum score required for unconditional admission. May consider scores lower than minimum. Students are required to be able to speak and write English clearly and well. Departments may have separate requirements for scores and TA positions. Regardless of test scores, students must meet the language requirement of their program. An English Proficiency Interview conducted under the auspices of the office of the Dean of Graduate Studies will be used to screen for students requiring remedial help in the form of an English as a Second Language (ESL) course. International students must satisfy the proficiency requirement upon appointment or pass the ESL course within two semesters to be eligible for consideration of continued appointment as a TA. 	
Universities in the State of Texas											
Texas Tech University		79	550	6.5					Required	To determine whether additional English training is required along with graduate coursework, further evaluation of English proficiency will be given after the student arrives on campus.	
University of North Texas		79	550	6.5					Not Stated	English study study at IELI(Intensive English.) Completion of Level 6 of the IELI programs. This qualifies you to apply for most graduate degree programs (check with your department)	

IBT = Internet Based TOEFL

PBT = Paper Based TOEFL

IELTS = International English Language Testing System

Researched by Monica Rodriguez, Manager of Graduate Admission's on March/April 2010

Most Schools have disclaimers that individual departments may have additional requirements for English Language Proficiency.

Degree requirements for exemptions vary amongst institutions. Bachelor's degree in US or English speaking country can exempts students at all universities listed, Master's degree only does not.

Most schools have separate language proficiency requirements for TA positions.

Short-Term Aspirant Universities										
Arizona State University		80	550	6.5					Required	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Individual academic units may have higher requirements. Please consult your department's website. The ITA program (International Teaching Assistant) serves ASU's academic departments that employ international students as teaching assistants and ASU international graduate students who want to become teaching assistants. The program provides testing services, teacher training and language support services. The SPEAK Test, Interview Test, and the ITA Seminar are administered through the ITA Program.
University of California Riverside		80	550						Required	They have TAST. All admitted applicants whose first language is not English and are expected to be Teaching Assistants are required, upon arrival at UCR, to take the TOEFL Academic Speaking Test (TAST). The TAST evaluates English speaking proficiency at the intermediate to advanced levels. TAST is developed from the speaking section of the next generation TOEFL test. It presents test takers with integrated speaking tasks that simulate real academic situations.
University of Connecticut		80	550	6.5					Required	If you are not a native speaker of English and are going to hold a teaching assistantship, we will assess your oral English proficiency when you arrive on campus. See www.itap.uconn.edu for details. If you have an IELTS score of 8.0 or higher on the Speaking band, that qualifies you for classroom contact with no further English proficiency testing. Before you are asked to teach in the classroom, our International Teaching Assistant Program staff will work with you to increase your conversational English proficiency if their assessment shows that you need it.
University of Central Florida		80		6.5					Required	Students who are non-native speakers of English (and do not have a degree from a U.S. institution) must pass the SPEAK exam administered by the UCF Center for Multilingual Multicultural Studies before they will be permitted to teach as a Graduate Teaching Associate or Graduate Teaching Assistant.
University of Oklahoma		79	550	6.5					Don't meet requirement, automatically in Lang. Program	Note to Graduate Applicants: Some graduate programs will not review an applicant's credentials for admission until the English proficiency requirement has first been satisfied. English proficiency can be established by submitting a TOEFL score of at least 500/173/61 or IELTS score of 5.5 and then satisfactorily completing minimum of 12 weeks intensive English language training at a Regents-approved school immediately prior to beginning regular classes. No college credit is awarded for intensive English language study.
Long-Term Aspirant Universities										
University of California Santa Barbara		80	550	7.0						<p>English Language Placement Exam (ELPE)</p> <p>All incoming international graduate students and permanent residents whose first language is not English must take the English Language Placement Examination (ELPE) at the beginning of their first quarter of enrollment.</p> <p>Exception: International applicants who completed the entirety of their undergraduate degree at an institution where the medium of instruction was English-only are exempt from taking the ELPE. If exempt, students will be contacted by the Office of International Students and Scholars.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> This required exam is conducted by faculty of the English as a Second Language (ESL) Program. For graduate students, the ELPE includes both a written and an oral examination. After the writing exam, students make individual appointments through the ESL Program to take the oral exam on a different day. The results of the ELPE are communicated to each department by the ESL Program. As a result of the student's performance on the ELPE, the student will either (1) be placed in an ESL course or (2) be exempted from ESL courses. Students are advised to complete the ESL course progression within three quarters. Testing dates, times, and locations are available through the ESL Program, the Office of International Students and Scholars, and the Schedule of Classes.
University of Colorado Boulder				6.0					Many requirements/program	If you need additional instruction in English, you may wish to enroll at the university's International English Center.
Rutgers University		79	550	7.0	21	17	23	22		Individual programs may have higher requirements for language intensive areas such as History English Psychology and others. • Based on the SPEAK scores, ITAs are given the corresponding code and class placement, a score of 50 or below are unable to teach.